

To the Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation
and Quality Assurance in Higher Education
and Health care
October 27, 2022

REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE
INSTITUTIONAL EVALUATION OF THE KAZAKH SCIENTIFIC CENTER
OF DERMATOLOGY AND INFECTIOUS DISEASES OF THE MINISTRY OF
HEALTH OF THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN FOR COMPLIANCE WITH
THE STANDARDS FOR INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF
POSTGRADUATE, ADDITIONAL AND NON-FORMAL EDUCATIONAL
ORGANIZATIONS (CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)

external expert evaluation period: October 17-19, 2022

Almaty, 2022

content

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the Kazakh Scientific Center of Dermatology and Infectious Diseases	4
2.2	Information on previous accreditation	7
2.3	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the KSCD&ID for compliance with the Standards for institutional accreditation of organizations of postgraduate, additional and non-formal education (continuous professional development) and conclusions	7
3.	Description of the external expert assessment and conclusion	8
4.	Results of a survey of teachers and students	12
5.	Analysis of compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation based on the results of the external assessment of the KSCD&ID__	17
6.	Recommendations for improving the institutional activities of the KSCD&ID	41
7.	Recommendations to the Accreditation Council	42-43
	Attachment 1. Institutional quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the KSCD&ID for compliance with the Standards for institutional accreditation of organizations of postgraduate, additional and non-formal education (continuing professional development)	44
	Attachment 2. List of documents reviewed as part of an external expert assessment	45
	Attachment 3. Organization visit programme	46-48

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Transcript
RSE on REM "KSCD&ID" of MoH of RoK	Republican State Enterprise on the right of economic management "Kazakh Scientific Center of Dermatology and Infectious Diseases" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
RSVI of MoH of RoK	Research Skin and Venereological Institute of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
SC	Scientific Center
PHC	Primary health care
STIs	Sexually transmitted infections
EP	Educational programme
CSHI	Compulsory social Health insurance
GVFMC	Guaranteed volume of free medical care
TS	Teaching staff
HIV	Human immunodeficiency virus
RoK	Republic of Kazakhstan
TEPI	Typical Educational plan
GIBT	Genetic Engineering biological therapy
AIDS	Acquired immunodeficiency syndrome
GP	General practitioner
SC	Certification course
AT	Advanced training
CSVD	City Skin and Venereal Dispensary
RSVD	Regional Skin and Venereology Dispensary
WHO	World Health Organization
CDCP	Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
University	Higher Educational Institution
IJSC	Independent Joint Stock Company
EMC	Educational and Methodological Council
ILDS	International League of Dermatological Societies
EADV	European Academy of Dermatology and Venereology
VR Foundation	Vitiligo Research Foundation
LEC	Local Ethical comission
RW	Research work

1. Composition Of The External Expert Commission

In accordance with the ECAQA Order No. 26 of October 06 2022, 2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct the institutional accreditation of KSCD&ID in the period of October 17-19, 2022, consisting of the following members:

№ n /	a Status in the EEC	Full name	Regalia, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairperson	of Balmukhanova Aigul Vladimirovna	MD, Professor, corresponding member. NAS RK, Head of the Department of Surgical Disciplines International medical school Caspian University
2	Foreign expert	Gulnara Ibadova	MD, Professor, Head of the Department of Infectious and Parasitic Diseases of Children of the Center for the Development of Professional Qualifications of Medical Workers of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan
3	Kazakh academic expert	Imasheva Bagdat Sakenovna	MD, Professor, Adviser to the Chairperson of the Board
4	National Academic Expert	Almira Kalikapasovna Akhmetova	CMS, Associate Professor, Acting Professor of the Department of Infectious Diseases, Dermatovenereology and Immunology of the Semey Medical University NJSC
5	Representative of employers	Meruert Temirtasovna Amanzholova	Head of the Skin and Venereology Dispensary Department of the Pavlodar Regional Hospital named after G. Sultanov, freelance dermatovenerologist of Pavlodar region
6	Representative of students	Elvira Sakhabayeva	resident of the second year of study in the specialty " Dermatovenerology (adult, children's) "of the Kazakh-Russian Medical University

Observer for ECAQA – Makpal Umarova, Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC (Order of the Director general of the ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EC report contains an assessment of the KSCD&ID for compliance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of organizations of Postgraduate, Additional and Non-formal education (Continuing Professional Development) (hereinafter referred to as Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the ECC for further improvement of the activities of the above-mentioned organization, and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the Kazakh Scientific Center of Dermatology and Infectious Diseases of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan

Name of the organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	RSE on REM "Kazakh Scientific Center of Dermatology and Infectious Diseases" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Full name of the first head	Abishev Asylkhan Turekhanovich
Date of establishment	Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 565 dated September 14, 2018
Location and contact details	Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty 050002, Almaty, Raiymbek Avenue, 60 Phone: + 7 (727) 397-42-23 E-mail: info@Kncdiz.kz Official website: http://www.kncdizwww.kncdiz.kz
Information about branches and subsidiaries (if available)	Not available
Total number of educational programmes, separately for additional and non-formal education	– 1 residency programme in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" (implemented since 2018) – 10 programmes for additional and non-formal education
Total number of trained residents and trainees since the beginning of the activity	65 graduates of the residency 58 residents are currently studying 104 trainees
Number of trainees with higher education	75
Number of students with specialized secondary education	29
Number of students since the beginning of this year	62
Full-time teachers / part-timers	8/7 <i>% of students settled down-53%</i>

RSE on REM "Kazakh Scientific Center of Dermatology and Infectious Diseases" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan was formed in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 565 dated September 14, 2018 "On certain issues of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan" by combining two organizations of RSE on REM "Scientific Research Skin and Venereal Institute" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and RSE on REM "Republican Center for the Fight against AIDS".

The Skin and Venereal Institute was established in 1930 by the order of the People's Commissariat of Health of the Kazakh ASSR on the basis of the Alma-Ata Children's Skin and Venereal Hospital and the Alma-Ata Skin and Venereal Dispensary and was originally called the "Regional Research Skin and Venereal Institute". The staff of the Institute in the year of its opening was 58 people.

Since 1994, the KSCD&ID has had a specialized Council for the defense of candidate theses, at which meetings 25 candidate theses were defended, and on 02.03.2000 the Dissertation Council (code 09.09.01) for the defense of doctoral theses was opened, at which 1 doctoral and 17 candidate theses were defended.

KSCD&ID is the legal successor of the Research Institute of Skin and Venereology of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (<https://kncdiz.kz/ru/obrazovanie/litsenziya/>).

KSCD&ID is a scientific, organizational, methodological, educational and clinical center of Kazakhstan in the field of HIV/AIDS, STIs, and skin diseases. It has departments in its structure: dermatovenerology, physiotherapy, consulting and diagnostic, clinical and diagnostic laboratory,

including groups of biochemistry with skin pathomorphology and paraclinical studies, serology, clinical immunology and immunocorrection, microbiology, information and analytical monitoring and strategic development, epidemiological monitoring, prevention and public relations, scientific management, international cooperation and the Department of Postgraduate Education. There are 172 employees.

There is a Supervisory Board in KSCD&ID.

KSCD&ID systematically and dynamically cooperates with regional institutions of the country, betweenational public organizations (CDC, USAID, WHO), leading scientific centers of the USA, Europe, Russia and other countries.

Based on WHO recommendations, diagnostic and treatment protocols, algorithms of measures for early syphilis, congenital and late infection that meet international requirements were developed (approved by the Joint Commission on the Quality of Medical Services of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Protocol No. 60 of March 29, 2019).

Currently, the publication of the specialized journal "Issues of Dermatology and Venereology" continues (<http://Kncdiz.kz/ru/nauka/page62133/>).

An electronic document management system with the software package of the automated administration system "Documentolog-7.3.8 " with an email address <https://rcaids.documentolog.kz>.

The management and staff of KSCD&ID strive to develop and improve scientific and clinical activities, to ensure high quality of postgraduate and additional education, based on the growing shortage of specialists in the field of dermatovenerology, especially at the level of primary health care (PHC).

KSCD&ID has experience in coordinating the country's dermatovenerological service, highly qualified and experienced employees who are involved in the educational process, a unique diagnostic base, and the presence of its own clinic.

KSCD&ID previously conducted training in retraining programmes, and for the last 5 years it has been implementing advanced training programmes for specialists in the field of dermatovenerology, dermato-cosmetology (adult, children's).

Currently, KSCD&ID conducts training in only one programme-residency 7R09112 - "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's) "(license no. KZ 70LAA00016692 dated 23.07.2019). <http://Kncdiz.kz/ru/obrazovanie/litsenziya/>). Since 2018, training was conducted on a contractual fee basis, as there was no state order for training residents. At the same time, when collecting feedback from residents and representatives of practical Health care, there is a great demand for the above-mentioned specialty.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

KSCD&ID have a state license for educational activities No. KZ 70LAA00016692 dated 23.07.2019, issued by the State Institution "Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan".

On June 25, 2018, KSCD&ID was accredited by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IQAA). IA-C Institutional Accreditation Certificate No. 12, valid until June 23, 2023. Certificate of specialized accreditation IS-C No. 0002 dated June 25, 2018 of the educational programme 6R111400 - "Dermatovenerology, including children's".

2.3 Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on the self-assessment of KSCD&ID for compliance with the Standards for institutional accreditation of organizations of postgraduate, additional and non-formal education (continuous professional development)

The report on the institutional self-assessment of the KSCD&ID (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 83 pages of the main text, 26 pages of appendices, copies or electronic versions of documents located at the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14Zsd7f6MC3fhRrNZ00wo0Sj4bjvbNner>.

The report is characterized by complete responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured according to the recommendations of the ECAQA Institutional Self-Assessment Guide, and internal unity of information.

The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the Director of KSCD&ID Abishev Asylkhan Turekhanovich, PhD, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 6 members of the internal self-assessment commission with an indication of the responsibility of each employee, as well as information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the institutional self – assessment-Ospanova Sanimbala Almeshevna PhD, Head of the Department of Postgraduate Education of the KSCD&ID.

The institutional self-assessment of the KSCD&ID was carried out on the basis of Order No. 108-P of 13.04.2022 "On the preparation and implementation of procedures for institutional and specialized accreditation".

The report was reviewed by accreditation experts A.V. Balmukhanova and B. S. Imasheva, and the reviews highlighted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes.

Thus, in the process of feedback from the representative of the KSCD&ID, the experts received answers to the questions that arose, and the report on institutional self-assessment made appropriate changes and additions based on the recommendations of reviewers. The report is submitted to the ECAQA in a complete form, with data corrected for the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, and described in accordance with the standards criterion, tables and figures contain links in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure – external evaluation. Experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be received during the visit to the educational organization, i.e., verify quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work within the framework of the institutional assessment of the KSCD&ID was organized in accordance with the "Guidelines for conducting an external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of the ECAQA" and according to the visit programme (Annex 3), approved by the Director General of the ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S. S. on October 06, 2022. and agreed with the director of the KSCD&ID Abishev A. T. Dates of visit to the organization: 17-19 October 2022.

External evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of implementation of the visit within 3 days is described in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is proof of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of external expert evaluation.

The following methods and their results were used to obtain objective information by the members of the EEC:

- interview with management and administrative staff – 5 people;
- interviews with residents – 10 people;
- interviews with listeners – 4 people.
- exploring a website - <https://kncdiz.kz/info@Kncdiz.kz>;
- interviewing - 11 employees, 4 teachers;
- survey of teachers-11, residents-36;
- monitoring the organization of training:
 1. Topic: "Bullous epidermolysis", teacher Idrisova A. S., contingent of students: residents of the 1st year of study, venue: study room, clinical building;
 2. Topic: "Podological solutions for chronic dermatoses", teacher Arinova A. N., contingent of students: residents of the 2nd year of study, venue: study room, administrative building of the KSCD&ID;

3. Topic: "Prevention of HIV infection and rapid testing", teacher Musina Zh. Zh., residents of the 2nd year of study, venue: study room, administrative building of KSCD&ID;

- Review of resources in the context of implementation of accreditation standards: 4 bases of practice/clinical engagement were visited, including: KSCD&ID Clinic, clinical building, 62 Raiymbek Ave.; Vitiligo and Skin Health Center LLP, Almaty-Rodnik Residential Complex, 284/1 Zharokova str.; Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education LLP, Almaty – 118 Shevchenko St.; National Center for Additional Medical Professional Education "YES" LLP - 75/1 Bukhar Zhyrau St., where training is conducted under an accredited educational programme with the participation of 8 full-time teachers/ part-timers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 23 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (see Attachment 2 for the list of documents studied).

All full – time teachers are involved in internal bases, and employees of the centers are involved in external bases according to memoranda, as well as one part-time employee.

Educational and methodological documents in the amount of 23 units were studied both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (see Attachment 2 for the list of documents studied).

On the part of the staff of the accredited organization, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites and interviews (Table 1) is ensured.

Table 1-Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, and interviews with EEC members

No	. Position	Number
1	Management of KSCD&ID	5
2	Management of the educational sector	6
3	Management of the scientific sector	7
4	Heads of educational programmes	6
5	Personnel Department employees	4
6	Heads and employees of auxiliary (supporting) divisions	8
7	Residents	10
8	Graduates of residency programmes	13
9	Teachers and mentors	11
10	Students of additional education programmes	4
11	Employers of graduates of programmes residencies and add-ons educational institutions	5

Thus, when implementing the program’s activities, namely, following an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the advisory body (representatives of the administration), in interviews with students and teachers, compliance with the criteria **of standard 1** was established.

All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, and the mission was brought to the attention of potential students through the website, social networks, and informational letters to medical organizations.

The strategic plan of the RSE on REM "Kazakh Scientific Center of Dermatology and Infectious Diseases" for 2020-2024 was developed in accordance with the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Public Health and the Health system" dated July 7, 2020 No. 360-VI 3RK, approved on December 26, 2019 No. 982 of the State Programme for Health Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025 and the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and is aimed at providing high-quality and affordable Health care.

The Strategic Plan identifies two main strategic directions, each of which has its own priority areas (goals) and target indicators. The first strategic direction is devoted to the provision of medical and social services for HIV infection, sexually transmitted infections (STIs), dermatoses among the population, as well as viral hepatitis. The second direction is devoted to the development of scientific and innovative activities and improving the efficiency of human resource management. This direction, according to the expert commission, reflects the goals and objectives in postgraduate and additional education, which is currently accredited. The main goal is to increase human resources, improve the financing system and develop scientific and educational activities, and train highly qualified and competitive Health care professionals.

Measures to implement this direction are the introduction of the main principles of corporate governance in the management of the department, increasing profits by expanding the list of paid medical care, strengthening the material and technical base, accreditation of KSCD&ID as a medical organization that meets national standards, public-private partnership in the diagnosis and treatment of HIV, STIs and viral hepatitis.

The strategic plan provides for measures to dynamically develop the system of dermatovenereological care for the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan by creating conditions for the transition to low-cost and resource-saving forms of dermatovenereological technology, increasing the planned rehabilitation of infectious skin diseases, accessibility and timeliness of high-quality dermatovenereological care, and introducing modern high-tech methods of diagnosis and treatment. As well as creating conditions for motivating professional and personal growth of medical personnel, adapting the system of dermatovenereological care to modern requirements and market conditions of society, and reorganizing dispensaries. Based on this, KSCD&ID uses quality planning as a guiding idea in the provision of educational and medical services, considering the value of modern postgraduate education is increasingly determined not by the amount of knowledge gained, but by the result corresponding to the totality of professional competencies obtained in KSCD&ID, as the main quality criterion in the educational activities of KSCD&ID.

From interviews with 5 students, it was found that before starting classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases, and the ability to create an individual training schedule. This indicates compliance **with standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs and wishes of individual students.

The organization's documents include an educational residency programme "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", advanced training programmes, methodological materials for non-formal education, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. It is established that the educational programme of the SSE residency meets the standard requirements.

Experts saw that residents were committed to organizing education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment on organizing training, evaluating their skills, providing advisory support, opportunities to participate in research, and funding. The experts examined the documents of residents (portfolios, results of the residents 'assessment-checklists, results of the residents' survey).

The conversation with the head of the Department of Postgraduate Education S. A. Ospanova and the researcher of the Department of Postgraduate Education Z. M. Sukhanberdiyeva included such issues as cooperation with clinical databases, the content of the "Regulations on Clinical Databases", "Regulations on Clinical Mentors", about the rules of admission to residency and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical databases for teachers (there are 5 such dermatovenerology teachers in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, information security of the educational programme, as well as identify problems in human resource management and development, since part-timers need training in teaching methods and evaluating residents.

Interviews with 5 teachers of the residency programme "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's) " showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the

specific base (access of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical documentation, independent work). Experts received answers about 10 teacher training programmes, funding for this training, and whether teachers have certification in teaching methods. Most of the training is conducted in dermatology, dermatocosmetology and HIV infection, which is due to the availability of appropriate teaching staff.

On the same day, the experts examined the materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance **with standard 4**.

In order to verify the data **of standard 5**, external experts obtained opinions on the personnel policy and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation.

During visits to clinical bases where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programmes, availability for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical Health care. The experts obtained evidence of compliance **with standard 6**, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

Interviews with 5 employers were conducted online and offline, and included questions such as: knowledge of the KSCD&ID mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, the percentage of employed graduates of the residency programme, etc.

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, one of the main clinical bases was visited: the KSCD&ID clinic with a total bed capacity of 50 inpatient beds, and the employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relations with medical staff, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of training residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients, state-of-the-art equipment and accessibility to students are provided, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and mentors provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of an external assessment. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was conducted. EEC members have started drafting the final EEC report. Generalizations of the results of external evaluation are made. Experts individually filled out the "Quality profile and external evaluation criteria of the educational programme 7R01112 - "Adult Dermatovenerology, children" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed, and the chairperson of the Board, A.V. Balmukhanova, held a final open vote on the period of accreditation of educational programmes - 3 years, as well as on the recommendations of the institutional accreditation of an educational organization – 5 years.

Conclusion: The members of the expert commission made certain conclusions on the study of the self-assessment report, documents submitted to experts and external evaluation:

- It is necessary to strengthen the strategic plan for the development of KSCD&ID in the direction of scientific activities.

To achieve this goal, the center's staff should be trained through master's and doctoral programmes in cooperation with medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan, include a scientific component based on evidence-based medicine and up-to-date literature data in the educational programme of the residency, provide work (access) to modern resources of international databases. In order to strengthen the status of KSCD&ID, it is also necessary to consolidate the service of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

4. Results of the survey.

During the period from 17.10-19.10.2022, an online survey was conducted by the ECAQA observer on the website <https://webanketa.com/>.

The survey of residents includes 23 questions.

A total of 36 resident dermatovenereologists responded. It was determined that more than half of the respondents are residents of the 1st year of study (20 people/55.5%), 16 people (44.4%) of the second year of study. The overwhelming majority of respondents - 31 people (86.1%) - recommend training in KSCD&ID to their environment, 3 people (8.3%) partially agreed with this statement.

35 residents (97.2%) believe that educational programme managers and teachers are aware of students' problems related to learning. According to 31 residents (86.1%), programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, educational programme committees).

The assessment of satisfaction with the conditions for training and equipment of classrooms and auditoriums of KSCD&ID showed that 32 people out of 36 (88.9%) are fully satisfied with the conditions provided and 4 people (11.1%) are partially satisfied.

34 (99.4%) noted that students have access to participate in research work in the KSCD&ID, 2 people (5.6%) partially agree.

According to 35 residents (97.2%), "Teachers provided me with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes."

The response of 19 residents (52.8%) showed that they are engaged in scientific work under the guidance of their teacher or mentor; 6 people (16.6%) have started planning research; 8 people (22.2%) have not yet decided on the topic of research.

24 people (66.6%) were fully satisfied with the library fund of the KSCD&ID, 7 (19.4%) were partially satisfied, and 5 (13.9%) did not give an answer.

To the question "Are you satisfied with the organization of teaching (the amount of time for practical training, the place of seminars, the topics of seminars)", 34 respondents (94.4%) said that they are completely satisfied.

According to 34 respondents (94.4%), they have sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, assisted operations); they are satisfied with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills; teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in the classroom.

35 students (97.2%) are confident that the organization of education allows them to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in their chosen specialty.

The organization of clinical training was rated as "excellent" by 31 people (86.1%), 4 people (11.1%) rated as "good", 1 (2.8%) "satisfactory"

To the question "Do you think accreditation of an educational institution and educational programmes is an important and necessary mechanism for ensuring the quality of education in residency", 35 residents (97.2%) answered "yes, it is so", 1 resident (2.8% – "I don't know what it is"

To the question "Choose one or several answer options that characterize the most important tool for external expert evaluation, which allows you to draw conclusions about the quality of educational programmes", 20 residents (55.5%) answered that this is an interview with the management of KSCD&ID, 18 people (50.5%) answered "an interview with teachers", 15 (41.7%) It was noted that interviews with resident mentors, 6 (16.6%) - interviews with graduates of KDIZ, 8 (22.2%) - study of documentation on the educational programme, 15 (41.6%) -interviews with residents, 11 (30.5%)-review of the resource base for training residents, 18 (50.5%) -attending practical classes and seminars and 4 residents (11.1%) - answered "I can't answer this question".

The teachers' survey included 25 questionnaire questions

A total of 11 teachers were surveyed, including 28.3% with up to 5 years of work experience, 22.12% with 5-10 years of experience, and 49.6% with more than 10 years of experience. 58.4% noted that they teach in residency.

74.3% are fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process in this educational institution, 22.1% are partially satisfied, and 2.65% are partially dissatisfied.

In this educational organization, ethics and subordination are observed in relations between colleagues, teachers, and management, 86.7% of respondents noted, while 11.5% partially agreed. 75.2% are completely satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in this educational organization, 23.0% partially agree. The organization offers opportunities for career growth and development of teacher competencies, which was noted by 70.8% of respondents.

75.2 % of respondents fully agree that in this educational organization they have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results.

46.9% of respondents are completely satisfied with the salary, 5.3% disagree with it, 83.2% are completely satisfied with the work of the service, and 13.3% are partially satisfied.

49.6% of teaching staff were trained in professional development courses (programmes) during this year, 31.0% were trained more than 5 years ago, and 7.1% do not remember when it was. 73.5% of respondents believe that the discipline is provided with sufficient resources (classrooms, equipment) - fully-and 22.1% - partially.

Personally participated in the development of the educational programme in the discipline that is taught: yes, 63.7% of teaching staff were active, no, 15.0% did not participate, 7.1% were only electives, 6.2% were not involved in the work.

We fully agree that students have free access to patients at the clinical bases of educational organizations to improve their practical skills - 85.8%.

Teaching staff assess their publication activity on a scale of 5 points (from 1-low to 5-high) - 17.1% as "1", 7.1% as "2" points, 19.5 % as "3" points, 23,9% - "4", 26,6 % - "5", they didn't give it to me the response rate was 17.7%.

To the question "Do educational organizations implement social support programmes for teachers?" - 38.9% answered that such programmes exist, 2.65% - have already used it, 44.3 % do not know about it, 10.6% doubt the answer.

65.5% of respondents said that the organization's management systematically listens to their opinion on the educational process, research and clinical work.

To the question "What teaching methods do you most often use in the process of training residents", 48.7% of people answered that they conduct lectures more often. Oral analysis of the topic of the lesson - 72.6%, Rewriting of thematic information from monographs-10.6%, Problem-oriented training-40.7%, Interactive training-46.9%, Implementation of research papers-34.5%, Practical classes on clinical skills in the training and clinical center-56.6%, Analysis of situational problems-75.2%, Compilation and solution case studies - 38.9%, Oral questioning of students-61.1%, Solving tests-48.7%, Working in small groups-53.9%, Writing tasks - 28.3%

70.8% of respondents fully agree that this survey is useful for developing recommendations for improving the organization's key areas of activity, while 14.2% partially agree.

31.9% answered that they were involved in activities related to the preparation for accreditation of the educational programme; 16.81% were engaged in technical support before the meeting of the external expert commission; wrote sections of the self-assessment report-12.4%; collected information for appendices to the self-assessment report-15.9%; and 23.9% of respondents were not involved in preparing the university for accreditation.

53.1% of respondents believe that the work of the external expert commission on accreditation can fully cover all issues related to the quality of educational programme implementation. According to 35.4% of people, the external expert commission examines all the main processes of implementing the educational programme; the programme of the commission's visit is rich and covers all key aspects of education - 28.3%. The programme of the commission includes interviews and interviews with interested parties, allowing to draw conclusions about the quality of training - 34.5%.

Respondents noted the activities of external expert work on accreditation, which are the most important and allow to obtain evidence of the implementation of accreditation standards: interview with the university management -7.96%; interview with the heads of educational programmes - 13.3%;

interviews with students -11.5%; interviews with graduates of programmes - 3.5%; interviews with employers ' representatives - 1.8%; visits to educational institutions - practical training bases-3.5%; survey of educational resources-0.88%; study of educational and methodological documentation-0%; interviews with teachers-1.8%; reviewing the programme self-assessment report-0%; attending practical classes - 2.7%; study of administrative documentation-0.88%; All of the above - 45.1%.

The results of the survey are presented in the Attachment and generally demonstrate the positive aspects of training in the residency programme, while at the same time identifying areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers and their participation in scientific conferences, increasing the publication activity of teaching staff, pedagogical competencies and professional development of teachers).

5. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the KSCD&ID

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

Proof of compliance:

1.1 Mission statement

The mission of KSCD&ID is developed in accordance with the current management system and is reflected in the Strategic Development Plan for 2020-2024, approved at the production meeting and agreed by the Vice-Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan E. K. Zhumatayev (No. 01-1-0 / 4973-ext dated 10.07.2020), is transparent and publicly accessible to all interested parties, and is aimed at improving the quality of medical services and educational services and posted on the site https://Kncdiz.kz/ru/osms/page://Kncdiz.kz/ru/osms/page62171/strategicheskiy_plan_plan/.

At the same time, the strategic plan of the KSCD&ID does not include indicators for scientific and educational activities. So, teachers evaluate their publication activity on a 5-point scale as follows: 17.1% as a " 1 " point, 7.1% as a "2" point, and 19.5 % as a "3" point, 23,9% - "4", 26,6 % - "5", no response-17.7%. Thus, approximately half of the respondents actually publish annually and actively.

Planning of participation of residents and teachers in competitions is not included. At the same time, in the survey, residents noted that the KSCD&ID has access to students ' participation in research work. And more than half of the respondents (52.8%) are engaged in scientific work under the guidance of their teacher-mentor.

Experts found that the strategic plan lacks planning for further training and pedagogical development of personnel involved in education. This could have been done during the annual adjustment of the strategic plan and included in the annual plan. Although the survey found that almost half of teachers (49.6%) were trained in professional development courses (programmes) during this year, but there was no answer about improving pedagogical competencies.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Training of specialists in advanced training of additional and non-formal education, residents is carried out on the basis of their own clinic, based on the trinity: science, education, practice, which contributes to professional search. At the same time, the material and technical base of KSCD&ID is rather outdated, and there is no own simulation equipment.

The team regularly implements specific training methods, for example, a patient-oriented approach, taking into account the specifics of dermatovenereological diseases. During the survey, students noted sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, clinical rounds, clinical reviews) – 94.44%. A high level of specialists, including those from practical Health care, contributes to the high-quality presentation of educational services.

In the survey, the majority (74.3%) of teachers and staff are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process in the KSCD&ID.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

The educational programme of the residency programme contains a list of final results, and residents are aware of them from the first days of classes. Trainees are also informed about the skills

they will acquire or improve during their professional development cycles. All programmes are competency-based. And this is subsequently evaluated by the National Center for Independent Examination. The skills of residents are strengthened through electives and admission to patients.

A Code of Ethics has been developed at KSCD&ID, which promotes the development of students' communication skills. 86.7% of respondents surveyed during the visit of the ECAQA experts noted the observance of ethics and subordination in relations between colleagues, teachers, and management. To further improve its activities, the organization conducts a questionnaire, the analysis of which helps to identify risks, the possibility of providing for their exclusion and prepare proposals for further improvement of the mission adjustment. Only 2/3 (65.5%) of the teachers surveyed during the commission's visit said that the management of KSCD&ID systematically listens to their opinion on the educational process, research, and clinical work. The accredited organization should analyze this result and involve teachers more actively in making decisions regarding the development of education and science.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results of training

In the course of the external visit interview, confirmation of a comprehensive discussion of the mission was received. Representatives of practical Health care, who are also employees of the KSCD&ID, make their suggestions during round tables, forums, and other joint events. At the same time, KSCD&ID does not have close cooperation with other medical organizations regarding the discussion of the mission and the educational process. Experts analyzed contracts with third-party organizations, where residents pass some disciplines of the educational programme. In fact, this is a formalized cooperation.

According to the results of the survey conducted by the ECAQA observer, 86.11% of employees and teachers are involved in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council). The press service provides information via the official website and social networks about the ongoing educational and clinical-practical events to all interested parties: students, employers, graduates.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Out of 11 standards conform: fully – 11.

Standard 1: completed

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

- 1) In order to strengthen scientific activities in the strategic development plan of the KSCD&ID, add:
 - participation in competitions of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, grant financing, competitions of young scientists, Zhas Galym, etc.;
 - planning of advanced training in teaching skills.
- 2) In order to further ensure the development of KSCD&ID and strengthen scientific potential, conduct training of employees through master's and doctoral studies in cooperation with universities in Kazakhstan (paragraph 1.1.3).

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

Proof of compliance:

2.1 Model of postgraduate, additional and non-formal education programmes

The model of the educational programme of the residency programme is focused on the final results of training and qualification requirements. Advanced training programmes (10 topics) are based on the details of health professionals in additional education in such areas as dermatovenerology, dermatocosmetology (adult, children's). The programme of the certification course in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (children's)" is compiled taking into account the provisions prescribed in: Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-303/2020.

On the basis of orders and regulatory provisions, KSCD&ID guarantees the content of postgraduate education programmes to the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, providing training for students in accordance with the name of the programme

and specialty. The qualification of the trainee after passing certification cycles and advanced training in the specialty "Dermatovenerology, dermatocosmetology (adult, children)" corresponds to the level of the national framework of qualifications in medical education and the Structure of Qualifications in the European Higher Education Area. (ESG 1.2), which is determined by passing a 2-stage examination at the National Center for Independent Examination and obtaining a specialist certificate.

In order to ensure the diversity and individuality of the content of educational programmes and to promote the development of practical competencies, KSCD&ID hosts open days, charity events for patients on the days of certain nosologies, such as World Psoriasis Day, Vitiligo, Leprosy Care, STI Control, Skin Health, as well as field events (<https://Kncdiz.kz/ru/press-sluzhba/press-relizy/>, <https://Kncdiz.kz/ru/kntsdiz/publishing/byulleten/>).

Teachers told the experts that residents are involved in conducting sanitary and educational work with outpatient and inpatient patients, giving lectures in city and regional skin and venereal dispensaries. And, indeed, when interviewing residents, experts found that they are actively involved in the initial admission of outpatient and inpatient patients with various dermatoses, skills and abilities to make justifications and conclusions in complex and unpredictable situations are evaluated and encouraged, when a resident or a listener meets complex and severe clinical cases for the first time. Thus, 94.4% of resident respondents noted that they have sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, assisted operations), and teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods.

When some gaps in the knowledge and skills of trainees (practitioners), professional attitudes and behavior, and management abilities are identified during professional development cycles and non-formal education programmes, which are also noted by the trainees themselves, patients are selected for clinical rounds, independent work topics, and reports at mini-practical conferences and seminars. When certifying trainees and / or evaluating the provision of medical care, no educational shortcomings were identified. All graduates of advanced training programmes, residency programmes are certified by 100% of graduates from the first time.

2.2 The scientific method

The very specifics of the educational programme suggest the inclusion of a scientific component in the training, especially since the best specialists in dermatovenerology and AIDS/HIV problems work in the KSCD&ID. Therefore, the content of educational programmes is developed on the basis of the principles of scientific methodology, evidence-based practice and experience. At the same time, it is necessary to regularly update the bibliography included in educational and methodological complexes. According to the management and the analysis of the self-assessment report, it was established that cooperation with regional medical organizations (regional skin and venereal dispensaries) is now expanding, which is important in the future for the employment of graduates of the residency programme.

There is a Council of Young Scientists in KSCD&ID, and regional scientific and practical forums are held to promote science and increase the number of young scientists. As previously described, more than half of the residents surveyed by experts are engaged in research and development, and 16.6% have started planning the research topic, but a quarter of respondents (22.2%) are still undecided about the research topic.

At the first meeting with the experts, the head of KSCD&ID spoke about the interaction of KSCD&ID with the specialized publications "Beautycode". The publication of the scientific and practical journal "Issues of Dermatology and Venereology" continues. Frequent publications are made in social networks (https://instagram.com/KSCD&ID_RSVI?igshid=YmMyMTA2M2Y=, <https://instagram.com/rcaidskazakhstan?igshid=YmMyMTA2M2Y=>). All this, according to experts, expands the views and contributes to the acquisition of new knowledge and skills among residents. Thus, residents can participate in the preparation of publications and become a co-author.

Cooperation with such international professional communities as IDS, ILDS, EADV, VR Foundation on the study and current trends in the treatment of pigmented skin disorders and its appendages increases awareness and qualification of differential diagnostic and therapeutic skills.

Collaboration with the Kazakh Republican Leprosarium and the Research Institute for the Study of Leprosy of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (Astrakhan) on the issues of ancient Hansen's disease (leprosy, leprosy), contributes to the scientific component of the educational process in residency and additional education.

In the report on the institutional self-assessment of the KSCD&ID and in a conversation with the management and employees, the facts of planning scientific work were confirmed. However, the strategic development plan (see point 1.1.1 of this report) does not contain indicators of scientific activity. Management also needs to think through sources for attracting additional resources to improve the outdated material and technical base, for organizing conferences, training seminars, and publications in the media.

A great advantage is the fact that training is conducted on its own clinical base, which provides residents and trainees with access to patients and equipment. Residents and trainees can also study in accredited multidisciplinary clinics and highly specialized research centers (this information will be reflected in Standard 6.). Therefore, 97.2% of residents surveyed are confident that the organization of education allows them to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in their chosen specialty.

2.3 Content of postgraduate, supplementary and non-formal education programmes and their relationship to health care provision

The content of the residency programme is subject to state standards and regulations in postgraduate education. The quality of the programme content is constantly evaluated for the completeness of coverage of all issues of dermatovenerology (adults, children's). Teaching methods are analyzed so that they allow residents to better assimilate topics. The practical part of the training is dominant, which was confirmed by a survey of residents. For example, in a survey of teachers, it was found that 63.7% of students participated in the development of the educational programme in the discipline, and 7.1% were electives. The vast majority of residents (94.4%) are satisfied with the organization of teaching (the amount of time for practical training, the place of seminars, the topics of seminars), and 97.2% of residents answered that teachers provide methodological and didactic materials, additional literature for preparing for classes. All this is evidence in favor of the high quality of the organization of the educational process in the residency programme. At the same time, the bibliography is not updated with modern scientific literature, and the training programme does not include a topic dedicated to the development of evidence-based medicine skills.

Experts believe that the scientific component should be prescribed in the individual curriculum of the resident in the form of performing and defending scientific projects or writing an article.

Experts also had questions about the frequency of seminars for residents. Many respondents answered differently, which made it difficult to judge. Although in the report and when talking to teachers, they talked about holding 2 seminars per week. This is also reflected in the training journal. However, during the survey of residents, 12 people (33.35%) answered that the seminar is held "once a week", 15 people (41.7%) "2-3 times a week", 3 people (8.33%) answered "1-2 times a month", 1 resident (2.8%) answered "1 once a month", 2 residents (5.56%) answered "daily", 1 resident (2.8%) answered "very rarely", 2 residents (5.56%) could not answer.

KSCD&ID is a scientific, organizational, methodological, educational and clinical center of Kazakhstan in the field of HIV/AIDS, sexually transmitted infections (STIs), and skin diseases. It has all the necessary divisions in its structure. Therefore, training is implemented that is adapted to the needs and wishes of individual students. They can study at the Corneo Dermatology Training Laboratory. Here, residents and trainees hone their skills in topical therapy /corneotherapy and communication skills, getting acquainted with new prescription and over-the-counter medicines and parapharmaceuticals. Students can freely study such areas as phototherapy, GIBT, aesthetic dermatology, dermatocosmetology, trichology, podology, destructive therapy and non-invasive diagnostics using HEINE DELTA 20 dermatoscopy with VISION software and histological examination of biopsy material with diagnosis verification.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Out of 13 standards conform: fully – 11, partially – 2.

Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

- 1) It is recommended to include a scientific component based on evidence-based medicine and up-to-date literature data in the educational programme of residency and additional non-formal education (paragraphs 2.2.1, 2.2.2).
- 2) Introduce the discipline "Management of scientific research" into the educational programme of the residency.

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT AND DOCUMENTATION

Proof of compliance:

3.1 Evaluation methods

The current assessment policy covers all types of academic achievements of students and their competencies in accordance with the regulatory legal acts in education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The assessment includes developed control and measurement tools, an oral survey, possession of practical skills during the examination of the patient, preparation of presentations as a fragment of independent work of students and residents, a portfolio and the formation of an assessment of the admission rating to the exam. To assess the knowledge of residents, a criterion is used on the scale of alphabetic and numeric designations, according to the ECTS credit system, which are developed by the Department of Postgraduate education of the KSCD&ID.

Teachers have developed evaluation criteria that are reflected in the curriculum: participation in hospital shifts and patient supervision; participation in diagnostic and therapeutic manipulations; evaluation sheet of resident essays (reports), work in the library and on the Internet; participation in scientific and practical conferences; participation in the preparation of albums, diagrams, tables, algorithms, slides; participation in dermatosurgical procedures.

According to the survey results, 94.4% of students are satisfied with the methods of assessing their knowledge and skills. At the same time, the use of computer-based assessment forms and the "Anti-plagiarism" system would enhance the quality of work. To the question "After completing classes, does the teacher give you feedback (listen to your opinion, conduct a mini-questionnaire, work on mistakes)", 32 people (88.9%) answered yes, constantly. 3 residents (8.3%) noted "sometimes", 1 person (2.8%) "never".

In order to maintain fairness during the examination period, an appeal commission is established annually by the order of the director of the KSCD&ID.

At the same time, the experts came to the unanimous opinion that the form of conducting an "oral ticket exam", which is mainly used in the KSCD, is not objective and transparent. Combined objective assessment methods should be actively implemented, including testing, MCQ, TBL, PBL, and resident self-assessments. The syllabus does not describe methods for evaluating residents (formative, summative, and final assessment).

The experts did not find any quantitative indicators for the implementation and evaluation of scientific work of residents.

3.2 Documentation of postgraduate, additional and non-formal education

The documentation of the Department of Postgraduate Education is kept according to the nomenclature of cases. It contains regulatory documents-plans, reports, regulations, contracts, applications, educational and methodological documentation - work programme, working curriculum, syllabus, journals and evaluation tools (checklists, statements), certificates of advanced training and certification courses, transcripts. Feedback from students is formed on the basis of monitoring and analysis of theoretical and practical knowledge and skills. Elective subjects are formed through a comprehensive discussion and approval at the Educational and Methodological Council. Academic performance and attendance of residents and trainees are reflected in the journals.

Experts have found that the KSCD&ID does not have a process for documenting the assessment of the validity and reliability of control and measurement tools. And this is necessary for their continuous improvement.

The conclusions of the EEC. Out of 11 standards conform: fully -10, partially - 1.

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

- 1) Improve methods for assessing the academic performance of residents, including computer-generated forms and verification of independent work performed by residents under the "Anti-plagiarism" system (item 3.2.1).

Standard 4: THE HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS

Proof of compliance:

4.1 Motivation

The experts found that the history of KSCD&ID, experience in science and practice demonstrate that KSCD&ID is focused on providing conditions for the implementation of postgraduate (residency), continuous professional development of human resources and training of specialists in demand by society, combining high professional and socio-personal competencies to improve the quality of medical services and strengthen the health of the nation and contributing to the best adaptation of students in the educational, scientific and clinical environment.

KSCD&ID has created conditions for preserving and transferring values for students and teachers in order to better adapt to the educational, scientific and social environment. To adapt students of advanced training programmes and residents of the first year of study, it is planned to hold a "September 1 –" Day of Knowledge and Dedication " for instructing and getting acquainted with curators, highlighting the principle of operation of the administrative and clinical buildings and issuing a guide for students, which is also posted on the KSCD&ID website - www.kncdiz.kz.kz .

A key factor in the incentive mechanism for students ' participation in additional and non-formal education programmes is the need for certification (licensing) of a specialist with a frequency of once every five years, taking into account the accumulated credits. Also, at present, if you complete PC training cycles in a timely manner and submit documents on the elicens website elicens.kz [Қазақстан Республикасындағы электрондық лицензиялау Қызметті лицензиялау \(elicense.kz\)](http://elicens.kz) receive an extension of the specialist's certificate within 5 business days.

The system of continuous professional development helps to increase the student's motivation to learn by acquiring knowledge and skills in a short time period of 2 credits/60 hours. A system of incentives and rewards for students in the form of accumulation of necessary credits for 5 years, which contributes to their involvement in additional and non-formal education programmes in accordance with their needs. The Department of Postgraduate Education (PGE) was created specifically for the organization of the educational process and is responsible for the policy of attracting and receiving residents and trainees. The powers of the PGE are defined in the PGE Regulations.

According to the head of the Public Health Organization, when receiving students, employees of the public health organization collect all information that a Health care specialist really needs to study in residency or advanced training in the specialty "Dermatovenerology, dermatocosmetology (adult, children's)". The list of documents for admission to training is defined.

However, when applying for residents, you must comply with all the requirements of the "Regulations for Admission to Residency", as well as take into account the GPA at the end of your bachelor's degree and internship.

4.2. Training strategies

KSCD&ID provides residents and trainees with academic advice on the selection of electives within the residency programme and topics of advanced training programmes, depending on the personal requests of applicants, the wishes of their employers, the level of previous education, skills and competencies, and regulatory aspects.

The admissions Committee, based on the list of prerequisites for admission to the residency

programme developed by the , checks the documents for compliance with the specialty and the availability of the necessary prerequisites. For the period of conducting entrance examinations to the residency programme, the KSCD&ID has an examination commission in the specialty from among the employees of the KSCD&ID. The composition of the examination commission for the specialty consists of the chairperson and three members approved by the order of the Director of the KSCD&ID. The experts reviewed the relevant documentation and did not find any shortcomings.

The KSCD&ID guarantees transparency in the selection process and equal access to postgraduate education and advanced training programmes, which correspond to social obligations and needs in the field of public health protection by the dermatovenerological service and the AIDS control service. It is no secret that currently the threat of HIV spread is still relevant and in-depth training of specialists is required.

Within the framework of its selection policy, KSCD&ID highlights specific abilities of applicants in order to improve the result of the training process in the specialty "Dermatovenerology, dermatocosmetology (adult, children's)". Participation in dermatological circles, availability of literature reviews or articles with a clinical case on nosologies of a dermatovenerological profile, membership in professional communities is of great importance to determine their suitability and ability to work practically with patients with skin diseases. Additionally, you are encouraged to speak foreign languages at an above-average level. Residents said that admission to the residency programme takes into account the ability to work with various skin diseases, the lack of "squeamishness" and the presence of empathy for the patient, which determines the suitability for this specialty.

The staff of the PGE department told the experts that the KSCD&ID has approaches to periodically review the admission policy of students, including their number, based on relevant social and professional data, consultations with stakeholders (the ministry, clinic management), in order to meet the needs of health care. During the interviews with the management and teachers of KSCD&ID, it was established that it is planned to develop advanced training programmes that combine such disciplines as psychodermatology, dermatooncology, dermatosurgery, aesthetic dermatology, and cosmetic dermatology.

The number of accepted residents for an educational programme in relation to the existing material, technical and educational potential can vary from 20 to 40 applicants per year. Based on the improvement and updating of the material and technical base and the request of trainees and employers, a review of the recruitment of residents will be carried out. This approach to admitting students was introduced in 2022. To regulate the number of accepted residents, the demand for this specialty in practical Health care, including private practice, is taken into account. Interested parties are clinics, regional and municipal skin and venereal dispensaries of cities and regions of Kazakhstan, Ministries of Internal Affairs, multi-profile city and regional hospitals, regional military enlistment offices during conscription and enlistment commissions. Their applications for training specialists form the annual number of residents accepted for training. Today, the above-mentioned organizations in Atyrau, Kyzylorda, Uralsk, and Ust-Kamenogorsk are particularly concerned and necessary.

In order to avoid corruption and conflicts of interest, it is necessary to ensure transparency of the selection process and equal access to postgraduate education by introducing electronic testing, since oral exams do not guarantee this.

4.3 Participation and influence of residents and trainees on educational programmes

KSCD&ID actively involves students' representatives in the activities of consultative and advisory bodies responsible for developing the educational programme, namely, discussing topics of elective subjects, based on the interests and preferences of students. The preferences and targeted training of Health care professionals are also taken into account, taking into account the request of employers and the equipment of specialized organizations. For example, students were trained in a 60-hour advanced training programme on the topic "Combined methods of treatment of chronic dermatoses in combination with phototherapy" for doctors of the Regional Skin and Venereal Dispensary in Taraz, as well as a training cycle for students on the diagnosis of HIV and viral hepatitis for doctors of the AIDS Center in Almaty. During the interview, residents said that they can apply for additional internship during the

summer holidays in specialized institutions (Bisanova Arai, a resident of 1 year, had an internship at skin and venereal dispensaries in Taldykorgan, Kuvanova Aizhan, a graduate of 2022, had an internship at the dermatological department of the Sultanov Multidisciplinary Hospital in Pavlodar, etc.)

Participation of students, as well as interested parties in solving issues related to the educational programme and other issues related to the educational process (for example, discussion of the catalog of elective subjects, availability of targeted grants from specialized organizations, a request for training specialists in PC and SC programmes on certain topics) is achieved through round-table discussions, tables, meetings at scientific and practical conferences, congresses, master classes.

Methods of encouraging residents' participation in organizational processes related to education include writing official letters for internships and ensuring rotation within the framework of external academic mobility with further application for employment in specialized organizations.

At the same time, the experts did not find out how the PGE documents the representation of residents in the development of the educational programme, the policy of admission to residency, for example, through the Council of Residents.

4.4 Working conditions

The state order for residency in the specialty "Dermatovenerology, dermatocosmetology (adult, children's)" is not provided, therefore, the approved funding policy for students of KSCD&ID consists in organizing meetings with employers at KSCD&ID events in order to receive a targeted grant for the remaining period of study with further employment in a specialized organization. An additional source of funding is the provision of opportunities for extracurricular work in the specialty, as well as patronage in applying for employment after completing the residency programme.

For students of the SC and PC cycles, the funding policy consists in working closely with the management of relevant organizations, informing them about the availability of relevant topics of cycles with the possibility of concluding training contracts, including through the public procurement portal.

The presence of its own clinical databases at KSCD&ID creates a unique opportunity for students to improve their practical and theoretical skills, due to the number of patients (unique cases taking into account the national scale of the organization), consulting patients through the project "Telemedicine" under the guidance of leading specialists. The presence of a specific laboratory of the dermatovenerological service with a pathomorphological group makes it possible for students to independently collect material for histological examination, followed by its preparation, staining, examination and examination, taking biomaterial for microscopic examination for fungal flora, demodex, and the presence of acantholytic cells. As a coordinating center for the "Dermatovenerology" profile, KSCD&ID organizes field Open Days/visits of doctors to practical Health care organizations (<https://www.instagram.com/p/CgTLYfYor4Z/>, https://www.instagram.com/p/CfvhMWLrB_W/, <https://www.instagram.com/p/CfuHRB1N0vI/>, <https://www.instagram.com/p/Cdk8Y4YNfw0/>) with outpatient admission of patients.

Participation in conferences organized under the auspices of the KSCD&ID provides an opportunity not only to get acquainted with the latest innovations of the medical community, but also to participate as speakers (<https://www.instagram.com/p/CWdfwRNtTGo/>), but also conduct outpatient patient appointments (<https://www.instagram.com/p/CfTx-zjrK8J/>, https://www.instagram.com/p/CfJdEd_r1Tj/).

KSCD&ID maintains a balance between the educational and practical parts. The number of mandatory two shifts per month, which is determined by the number of residents, the schedule of disciplines and the workload of the clinic.

Thus, the presence of internal mobility of residents in the form of rotation between the structural divisions of the KSCD&ID, participation in conferences not only as a participant, but also as a speaker, the opportunity to participate in field outpatient appointments create conditions for professional development and scientific potential not to the detriment of the educational process.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Out of 13 standards conform: fully – 13.

Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

- 1) We consider it appropriate to develop an algorithm (methodological guide) on resident – patient interaction.

Standard 5: CPD PROVISION

Proof of compliance:

5.1 Recognition Policy and teachers

The HR policy of the KSCD&ID has a transparent recruitment system. Certification for the professional competence of specialists and the formation of an internal personnel reserve, which is drawn up in a protocol, are carried out. Clinical mentors are appointed by doctors from the center's clinic, where 54% are in the specialty: Dermatology. In 2019, 11% had the highest medical category, 41% in 2020, 2021-21%, and 19% in October 2022.

When applying for a job, preference is given to those who have settled down and have sufficient practical work experience. 9 people work with an academic degree, including 1-Doctor of Medical sciences, 8-candidate of Medical Sciences. For 2021-2022, there are 2 publications in Scopus and WoS, the Hirsch index for 2021-20, for 2022-16, the average Hirsch index of research and scientific teaching staff was for 2021 year 1.25 for 2022-1.06. For the period 2020-2022 in journals recommended by the Committee for Quality Control of Education and Science (CQCES) The Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan published 6 articles. According to the results of the survey conducted by the ECAQA, 100% of teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results. A survey of residents found that 97.2% of respondents fully agree with the statement that the teacher (mentor, curator) of this educational organization is an example for me as a professional doctor, a person (ethics, communication, appearance, speech).

Advanced training in health care organization and management in health care was completed by 5 employees, in pedagogy – 3 (topic: "Pedagogical skills. Mentoring" in the amount of 60 hours / 2 credits). Experts got acquainted with the portfolio of teachers. Teachers are involved in the development of clinical protocols.

Despite the fact that 9 people with an academic degree are involved in the educational process, it is desirable to strengthen the personnel structure and prescribe the possibility of accepting employees with an academic master's degree in the specialty profile in the personnel policy.

KSCD&ID periodically evaluates its activities externally, including through accreditation both as a medical organization and as an educational process.

5.2 Commitments and development of post-graduate, additional and non-formal education organizations

The advanced training programme corresponds to the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. KR DSM-303/2020 dated December 21, 2020, and the residency programme corresponds to the State Budget No. 28716 dated July 5, 2022. Within the framework of additional education, unique programmes have been prepared for students on the following topics: Topical issues of dermatovenerology, Topical issues of dermatocosmetology, Clinical and laboratory diagnostics, Combined methods of treatment of chronic dermatoses with the basics of phototherapy, Innovative technologies in dermatovenerology, including children's, Dermatoscopy in clinical practice, and others.

In the period 2019-2022, employees developed 14 methodological guidelines. However, as experts have found out, when developing elective topics, applications from practical Health care are not always collected.

There are no contracts with teachers and mentors in sub-specialties (related), such as oncology, gastroenterology, clinical and laboratory diagnostics, and infectious diseases, in the documentation of

the Public Health Organization. And this is relevant, since problems of the dermatological profile also exist in the above-mentioned sections of medicine. This will enrich and strengthen the staff.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Out of 11 standards conform: fully - 10, partially – 1.

Standard 5: completed

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

- 1) Strengthen the mechanism for monitoring the introduction and implementation of components in the residency training programme and advanced training programmes formed after receiving feedback from representatives of practical Health care.
- 2) When training residents, involve practitioners from both their own clinical base and third-party medical organizations in mentoring and document this process accordingly (point 5.2.3).

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL AND CPD ACTIVITIES

Proof of compliance:

6.1 Material and technical base

The infrastructure of KSCD&ID corresponds to the specifics of the activity, implementation of the educational programme of residency and advanced training cycles in the direction of "Dermatovenerology, dermatocosmetology (adult, children's)". KSCD&ID has two buildings with a total area of 9,344. 1 sq. m (at 60, 50a Raiymbek Avenue).

The buildings are equipped with appropriate offices and auditoriums, there is multimedia equipment, laboratory rooms with equipment, a clinic, an outpatient clinic, and a physiotherapy department. Experts examined all these premises and made sure that they comply with sanitary and epidemiological standards and regulations.

For the implementation of the educational process, there is a lecture hall with 250 seats, a training dermatological laboratory "Corneo", equipped with the necessary technical support facilities (a stationary multimedia projector, a hall with 50 seats, special equipment for conducting interactive classes), there is a hall for conducting "Telemedicine". All training rooms (offices of a dermatovenerologist, dermatocosmetologist, trichologist, podiatrist, laboratory assistant) can accommodate up to 40 seats. They have the necessary cabinet furniture, equipment for medical and diagnostic purposes and manuals, a computer / laptop, a projector.

The adequacy of educational resources is assessed by students upon graduation. The analysis of updating and improving the material and technical base of educational resources is discussed with students, employers, and teachers.

For example, 88.9% of the surveyed residents are fully satisfied with the conditions for training and the equipment of training rooms and classrooms of KSCD&ID, and 11.1% are partially satisfied. However, 73.5% of teachers surveyed noted that the availability of resources (classrooms, equipment) is good, and 22.1% are partially satisfied.

Employees of the Republican Library inform about innovations and provide assistance in bibliographic and patent search for information on issues of interest and nosologies. Residents noted that they are fully satisfied with the library fund's resources (66.6%). However, 19.4% of residents were partially satisfied, while 13.9% did not respond at all. These results of the survey should be analyzed by the management of the KSCD&ID in order to improve the library stock.

The IT department knows the system of providing information and provides advice on their use and provides services to teachers, students and employees of the organization to provide electronic access to information sources.

In order to allocate resources, department heads write a report to the director with a description of the problem and the necessary funds to eliminate the identified shortcomings. A signed report / application with 3 commercial proposals is submitted to the public procurement department to purchase the necessary equipment.

6.2 Training bases

The KSCD&ID Clinic provides a safe environment for employees, students, patients and their

caregivers.

KSCD&ID guarantees access to patients with various dermatovenereological nosologies both on an outpatient and inpatient level. 86.1% of the residents surveyed are completely satisfied with the organization of clinical training.

The total number of treated patients in the KSCD&ID clinic is increasing annually: compared to 2019, in 2020 by 12%, in 2021 by 17%. In 2022, 787 patients were treated in 7 months. At the same time, it is necessary to take into account the quarantine conditions introduced in the period 2020 due the COVID-19 pandemic.

The consulting and diagnostic department of KSCD&ID provides medical services on a contractual basis. In 2019, medical services were provided primarily to 2,576 patients, including 1,596 adults and 980 children; in 2020, 4,105 patients were provided primarily, including 2,641 adults and 1,461 children; in 2021, 4,318 patients were provided, including 1,3006 adults and 1,312 children; and in the first half of 2022, the total number of patients received medical services was increased. The number of primary admissions was 2,203, including 1,474 adults and 729 children. Among the first admitted patients, 152 patients were admitted for inpatient treatment at the KSCD&ID clinic in 2019, 2020-40, 2021-67, and 109 in the first half of 2022. This volume of medical care shows that there is a sufficient number of patients and, accordingly, clinical practice for residents and trainees.

KSCD&ID supports formal and informal collaboration with stakeholders to expand the clinical (practical) training base.

6.3 Information technology

All KSCD&ID computers are connected to the Internet. Residents' corporate mail contains all the necessary information, including literature sources.

You can subscribe to various electronic resources, including the resources of the Republican Interuniversity Electronic Library.

Experts reviewed electronic catalogs in the library and their availability on the Internet (Intranet). There is support for residents, teachers and staff in accessing modern databases (Scopus, ThomsonReuters, etc.).

Work is underway to automate library, bibliographic and information processes, and an electronic catalog of literature is being created. The number of items currently filled is about 1,000. Access to electronic documents will be provided from the corporate network for all departments of KSCD&ID.

Currently, KSCD&ID has national subscription access for employees and residents to such databases as: Thomson Reuters (Web of Science); Springer Link. Publicly available: PUBMED; eLibrary.EN; Unified Electronic Library; BioMed Central; RMS PabMedCentral; MedlinePlus; Evidence-based Medicine TripDatabase; National Institutes of Health; JAMA Network; Kaz NEB.

Information platforms such as "Zoom" and "Classroom" have been introduced for the distance learning process. In the period 2020-2022, the team and students participated in 24 national and foreign conferences held online.

Residents, teachers and employees freely use Internet services in the library hall, in the Department of postgraduate Education, on all computers of the KSCD&ID during classes. The corporate local area network provides 100% coverage of training rooms, clinical and administrative buildings of KSCD&ID. Access to the local network is provided to residents and employees of KSCD&ID registered in the corporate network of KSCD&ID, as well as access to the Internet is provided by the resident's office computers for residents.

There is an electronic document management system for external and internal documents Documentolog 7.8. Situational monitoring is carried out from video surveillance systems in the administrative building, medical and diagnostic training buildings, and visual monitoring of the external territory of the KSCD&ID.

In this way, KSCD&ID effectively and ethically uses information and communication technologies as an integrated part of training, ensuring that students and trainees have access to web resources, including the content of its website, to specialized international information networks, electronic databases, or other electronic learning tools.

6.4 Interaction with colleagues

Training and development of the ability to work effectively with colleagues and other Health care professionals in an interdisciplinary / interprofessional team for the purpose of multidisciplinary training and development of competencies among their colleagues and representatives of related professions during training is achieved by improving the dermatovenerological service with the creation of offices of psychodermatology, podiatry, trichology, dentistry, reception of specialists-therapist, gynecologist, allergist, urologist, sexual health offices.

Participation in regional training forums "20 regions of dermatovenerologists, dermatocosmetologists", the Academy of Multidisciplinary Dermatovenerology, Dermatological readings named after Zh. A. Orazymbetova, Open Door Days (<https://Kncdiz.kz/ru/press-sluzhba/press-relizy/>), conducted on a regular basis by the CDC, and promotes networking with colleagues and other health professionals.

Reports are published in the specialized publication Beautycode and the scientific and practical journal "Questions of dermatology and venereology" and social networks. The image of the doctor-scientist profession is actively promoted. Close cooperation with VR Foundation on the study and current trends in the treatment of pigmented disorders of the skin and its appendages makes it possible for young specialists to look at these problems as a medical task. On the issues of the ancient disease of Hansen's disease (leprosy) in the educational process of the residency, interacting with the Kazakh Republican Leprosarium and the Institute for the Study of Leprosy of the Russian Federation (Astrakhan), seminars and conferences are held that show that there is an ancient disease in modern society, but sometimes specialists forget about it and the patient expands the zone of contagiousness, in the case of a multi-bacterial form of the disease. To expand the boundaries and horizons of residents and young scientists, "Skin Health Days" are held annually under the auspices of ILDS (International Community of Dermatological Societies), in which they take an active part in the examination and examination of patients with various nosologies.

In the fall of 2019, VECA INTERACT brought together scientists, health professionals, young professionals, civil society representatives, and government officials to address issues facing individual countries in building capacity and strengthening HIV research and clinical links./AIDS.

KSCD&ID practices the formation of clinical (multidisciplinary) teams with the inclusion of students and students of the residency programme to participate in solving professional problems, where they can show their professional, ethical, communication and analytical skills in such events as field trips within the framework of the "Year of Children-2022" in the villages of Merke and Makhambet, Taraz, Atyrau and Shu.

Multidisciplinary teams held "Skin Health Day", "World Melanoma Day", "World Vitiligo Day", "World Psoriasis Day", "World STI Day", "World AIDS Day", "World Leprosy Day". This practice has an important practical place in postgraduate and additional education programmes in the training of residents and / or Health care professionals (trainees) in clinical interdisciplinary, interprofessional teams in conducting consultations, clinical reviews. Feedback on the results of teamwork was announced at the meetings and words of gratitude from patients were published in chats and Instagram. The benefits are invaluable, especially when solving complex clinical problems with specific severe patients, and students' theoretical knowledge supports practical skills and understanding of clinical thinking.

KSCD&ID In cooperation with interested parties (MAPO, Public Association "Society of Dermatovenerologists, Dermatocosmetologists and Leprologists", city and regional skin and venereal dispensaries, multidisciplinary regional and city hospitals, Vitiligo and Skin Health Center, DVC Clinic, State Institution Kazakh Republican Leper Colony, etc.), residents and students are invited to participate in regional, national and regional programmes. and international programmes, scientific meetings, and other formalized types of additional education.

The practice of involving postgraduate students and trainees in professional and scientific events has been developed. The activities are included in the strategic development plan of the KSCD&ID, the operational plan for the academic year.

Residents and teachers took part in the conference with international participation in the framework of the Skin Health Day 2020 (supported by ILDS): "Issues of modern clinical dermatovenerology, dermatocosmetology and leprology".

KSCD&ID organized the participation of residents, students, teachers and employees in the 21st All-Russian Congress of Dermatovenerologists and Cosmetologists. All participants received certificates.

87 dermatovenerologists, including students, participated in the "29th Congress, EADV Virtual-New Frontiers in Dermatology and Venereology" (October 29-31, 2020).

As well as all online events organized in 2021 were available to employees and residents.

Thus, all the events held strengthen the practice-oriented orientation of students, expand their horizons, open up prospects and play an important role in training and improving the skills of teachers, employees, doctors and residents who also make presentations.

6.5 Research and scientific achievements

Following the mission, KSCD&ID conducts research on the epidemiological situation in relation to socially significant skin diseases, as well as sexually transmitted infections. Since 2018, research has been carried out on the following topics: "Development of evidence-based approaches to rehabilitation in childhood epidermolysis bullosa". Professor K. S. Sailauova spoke on this topic in the TV programme of the Eurasia channel.

Since 2018, a study was launched on the topic: "Knowledge, informing the attitude of dermatologists in Kazakhstan to psychodermatology". Based on the results of the study, programmes will be developed within the framework of continuing medical education on the following topics: "Modern issues of psychodermatology", "Communication skills in solving conflict situations in dermatovenerology, dermatocosmetology".

In November 2018, the first Kazakhstan Tery-2018 Congress was held with the invitation of Professor of Psychodermatology M. Jafferani. In 2019, the journal JAMA Network Dermatology published an article "Psychodermatology: knowledge, awareness, and attitude of dermatologists in Kazakhstan", authors - Assel Markabayeva MD, Sanimbala Ospanova MD, Mohammad Jafferany MD (First published: 31 July 2019 <https://doi.org/10.1111/ijd.14608://doi.org/10.1111/ijd.14608>).

An improved model of clinical and laboratory monitoring of chronic recurrent dermatoses was proposed by the KSCD&ID; the prevention, control, diagnosis and treatment of STIs were improved.

Currently, international projects are being implemented under the following memoranda:

1) Cooperation Agreement with the US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention "Strengthening the Capacity of the Republican AIDS Center (RC AIDS) to implement programmes for HIV prevention, care and treatment/AIDS in Kazakhstan under the President's Emergency Plan to Fight AIDS (PEPFAR)";

2) Creating a framework for a sustainable HIV response in Kazakhstan.

Foreign organizations with which scientific and industrial relations are established:

1) In partnership with UNFPA, a study is being conducted to determine the duration of infection of newly identified cases of HIV infection "Determining the duration of infection among people who are first diagnosed with HIV infections in the Republic of Kazakhstan" Research period: from 01.08.2020 to 31.12.2021;

2) In the field of epidemiology and biostatistics, we conduct joint research activities with the French National Institute of Health and Medical Research (France REcherche Nord&Sub-hiv Hepatitis).(Inserm-ANRS).The research topic is "Using surveillance data on HIV-infected people initiating ART to map the HIV epidemic in Kazakhstan". Research period: from 01.01.2020 to 31.12.2023.

3) In partnership with Nazarbayev University, the study "Ways of HIV transmission in high-risk communities in Kazakhstan". Research period: from 24.07.2019 to 31.12.2020.

Currently, a study is being conducted on the basis of KSCD&ID to identify the genetic predisposition of people with Kazakh nationality to atopic dermatitis (project "National Programme for the introduction of personalized and preventive medicine in the Republic of Kazakhstan", Contract No.

43 dated August 26, 2021 for the implementation of research works). The interim results of the project were reported at the 12th regional forum of dermatovenereologists, dermatocosmetologists (Taraz) and the publication of a monograph is planned.

6.6 Training in alternative educational institutions

KSCD&ID cooperates with the largest foreign research clinics and research centers in the field of Health care: Columbia University (New York, USA); Reference Laboratory of the University of Wisconsin (USA); Russian Scientific Center of Dermatovenereology (Moscow, Russia) ; Institute for the Study of Leprosy (Astrakhan, Russia); Research Institute of the Russian Academy of Medical Sciences (Moscow, Russia). dermatology and Venereology of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

KSCD&ID is also a partner of various international public organizations involved in the prevention of STIs and HIV/AIDS in the Republic of Kazakhstan: WHO, USAID, UN/AIDS, Center for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC, USA).

As part of the academic exchange of residents, cooperation is carried out with the Pavlodar branch of Semey Medical University (MUS). Three residents from the Moscow State Medical University underwent a cycle of dermatocosmetology.

Residents of KSCD&ID can receive practical training in skin and venereal dispensaries in Atyrau, Pavlodar, Shymkent, Taraz, and in the Kyzylorda leper colony. The Astrakhan Institute for the Study of Leprosy is a platform for the implementation of foreign academic mobility of residents. Thus, KSCD&ID has opportunities for alternative training both within the country and abroad.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Out of 15 standards conform: fully – 14, partially – 1.

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

- 1) Expand practical bases corresponding to the profile/subject of educational programmes of postgraduate and additional education (6.2.2);
- 2) Provide access to up-to-date resources 24/7 with a subscription to international databases (6.1.3.).

Standard 7: EVALUATION OF CPD ACTIVITIES

Proof of compliance:

7.1 Mechanisms for monitoring and evaluating educational programmes

Educational programmes of residency and advanced training are developed in accordance with the NLA. The process of evaluating the quality of programmes begins with their development by teachers, discussion at meetings of the Department of postgraduate education, internal and external review (most often by employees of medical universities). Educational programmes are approved at a meeting of the Academic Council.

An important role in monitoring the quality of educational activities is played by the audit system of the Supervisory Board and the Academic Council that operates in KSCD&ID.

Evaluation of the educational programme is carried out at the internal and external levels. Internal evaluation of the educational programme is carried out by the Department of Postgraduate Education, the Educational and Methodological Council, and the Academic Council.

The mechanism of internal quality assessment and QMS expertise is implemented using the following criteria: compliance with the requirements of consumers (employers, students); availability of all educational and methodological materials in the structure of the EMCD; compliance with the volume of educational and methodological materials of the WC and the degree of development of topics.

If any inconsistencies are identified, the teaching materials are returned for revision and re-evaluated.

To assess the quality of the organization of the educational process, criteria and forms for assessing the quality of theoretical and practical classes should be developed.

External assessment is carried out by authorized bodies in the field of education and health, employers (state certification of graduates; inspections of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan; rating of research centers; questionnaires).

The results of the Final state certification and the employment rate of graduates clearly demonstrate the quality of the educational residency programme. KSCD&ID practices field trips to organizations where graduates are employed and supports WhatsApp chats.

At the same time, the quality control system of training at other clinical bases is not developed in KSCD&ID. Relationships with these resident training databases should be documented.

7.2 Feedback

Regular monitoring of the quality of educational programmes is carried out, which includes questioning residents, students, and collecting oral feedback from employers. Conducts a survey on the quality of educational programmes in the form of questionnaires for representatives of practical Health care during round tables, scientific and practical conferences, master classes, the results are analyzed, used for further improvement and planning.

Based on the results of an anonymous survey conducted by the ECAQA, it was confirmed that the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-survey, works on errors) - 88.89%. At the same time, conducting a survey via the Yandex form (or survey monkey, or webanket) for all categories (students, graduates, employers, teaching staff) would help to instantly respond to requests and suggestions (point 7.1.2). Experts studied analytical reports based on the results of a survey of residents, evaluated the developed recommendations, but could not trace the trajectory of their implementation aimed at improving the educational process.

At the same time, there is no systematic way to collect feedback, and an anonymous survey of residents would help to obtain more objective information. Also, the regularity of collecting feedback from potential resident employers, representatives of practical health care who cooperate with KSCD&ID, who could make a significant contribution to improving the content of the residency training programme and advanced training programmes, is not sufficiently developed.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Out of 10 standards conform: fully - 9, partially – 1.

Standard 7: completed

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

- 1) Conduct a systematic analysis of the results of training of residents and introduce anonymous surveys (questionnaires) of residents and employees to obtain objective data for the purpose of improvement (clause 7.1.1);
- 2) Provide advanced training programmes with topics on oncodermatology and venereal diseases in order to meet the needs of practical health care and in accordance with the requests of NPR students (paragraph 7.2.2).

Standard 8: ORGANISATION

Proof of compliance:

8.1 Documentation and requirements for planning postgraduate, continuing and non-formal education

After completing the residency programme, the graduate receives certificates of completion of the residency programme with a transcript. Then they register on the site <https://elicense.kz> and takes a two-step exam at the National Independent Examination Center (NCNE). Upon receiving a positive assessment, a certificate of a specialist for practical work in practical Health care is issued.

At the end of the professional development cycle, the student also registers on the site <https://elicense.kz> also receives a specialist certificate upon timely submission of documents.

Graduates of KSCD&ID are in demand in practical Health care in Kazakhstan and abroad. Thus, a graduate of the 2022 residency programme Somova L. N. was invited to work as a dermatologist in

the country of Qatar. Graduates of the residency programme have the right to continue their academic education under the "Doctoral Studies PhD" programme.

The training quality control system is implemented through requirements for conducting current, mid-term and final control, and procedures for eliminating academic debt. To assess students' knowledge, teachers develop criteria that are reflected in the relevant working curricula and syllabuses. Verification of academic achievements of residents is carried out through various forms of control and certification based on a point-rating system. Current monitoring of students' progress is carried out in accordance with the approved schedule of training sessions, compiled on the basis of working curricula and in accordance with the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan for specialties.

The quality of training in advanced training and residency cycles is evidenced by the results of IGA, certification of specialists, and feedback, which show high satisfaction with the level of teaching of profile and elective subjects, professional competence of teachers, and the quality of organizing practical, laboratory, and theoretical classes.

The educational process is documented in the Academic Calendar, on the basis of which the schedule of classes at the beginning of each year is developed, approved by the Director, and available on the KSCD&ID website. The student's absence from theoretical and practical classes is documented daily by the responsible teaching staff and monitored by the management of the KSCD&ID.

The management of KSCD&ID has a sufficient level of managerial competence and assumes responsibility for the implementation of all processes that ensure transparency of management and decision-making.

The participation of teachers in the management of the KSCD&ID is ensured by the opportunity to be elected to the collegial management bodies. The procedure for the election of collegial management bodies and their competence are determined by the Regulations and the Charter of the KSCD&ID.

The activities of collegial management bodies - the Academic Council, the Local Ethics Committee, the Educational and Methodological Council, the Supervisory Board in solving problems and organizational issues influence the development strategy of the KSCD&ID, its departments and make various proposals for improvement or reorganization, including the educational process. Residents together with teachers are members of the "Council of Young Scientists", where they take an equal part in the discussion and resolution of all issues.

8.2 Academic leadership

KSCD&ID has an organizational structure and is a leader in training residents and trainees in dermatology, dermatovenerology and dermatocosmetology. The Department of Postgraduate Education has been established and is functioning. Thus, the responsibility for the management, organization and implementation of postgraduate and additional and non-formal education programmes lies with the administration and each employee of the KSCD&ID and the activities carried out, and all activities strengthen the potential and mutual understanding among the team and students.

8.3 Allocation of budget and resources for training

According to the organizational structure of KSCD&ID, the responsibility and authority for managing the budget of postgraduate and additional education lies with the management of KSCD&ID. Supervision is carried out by the Supervisory Board. Annual financial audits demonstrate that the KSCD has an effective allocation of costs for the implementation and development of educational programmes, including the target budget for training; resources for the implementation and implementation of educational programmes; resources are allocated in accordance with the needs of the educational process.

The annual plan for the development of financial and economic activities and the report of the KSCD&ID are approved by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Supervisory Board.

KSCD&ID is responsible for its activities to the medical community, employees and students to introduce innovations in the training programme for providing medical care to the population. Supporting teachers and staff, KSCD&ID allocates resources and organizes field trips to international

specialized congresses on dermatovenerology, dermatocosmetology, infections, hepatitis and AIDS in cooperation with the Global Fund and partners.

Interviewed during an external expert evaluation, teachers noted that KSCD&ID supports teachers' participation in conferences. Thus, according to 21.7% of respondents, KSCD&ID pays for travel, travel expenses, registration fee, and according to 2.7% of respondents, they were paid only for travel. At the same time, 2.7% of respondents did not pay any expenses, and 30.9% did not contact the management about this.

Training in the specialty "Dermatovenerology" since 2019 is carried out on a contractual basis. Communication is being established with employers to allocate a targeted grant for residency in the specialty "Dermatovenerology, dermatocosmetology (adult, children's)" and in 2020 2 residents completed their training. In 2022, a 3-party contract was signed for the training of 3 residents (LEB from the UZ cities of Atyrau and Kyzylorda).

The management of KSCD&ID is based on a combination of the principles of unity of command and collegiality and in budget management. Contracts were signed for the purchase of IT resources and components for the work of departments and educational activities of the KSCD&ID. Funding for expenses related to educational activities is being increased, the renovation of premises is being completed with the expansion of the area for training, and systematic work is being carried out to update the material and technical base and modern equipment and consumables.

8.4 Administration

KSCD&ID applies effective and open criteria for the recruitment and appointment of teachers and guarantees equal employment opportunities that are consistent with legal requirements and any other selection criteria. Academic supervisors and teachers meet the qualification requirements. The requirements of the personnel policy for teaching staff and teachers who carry out training in additional education programmes correspond to the Charter and Personnel Policy of the KSCD&ID. The teaching staff is formed based on the needs for effective implementation of educational programmes in the specialty "Dermatovenerology, dermatocosmetology (adult, children's)" and other related disciplines, as well as based on the total academic load. The total number of teachers who have settled down is 80%.

The educational strategy of KSCD&ID involves the implementation in practice of the following tasks:: 1) Introduction of international standards of management and development of scientific and practical activities competitive in the Republic of Kazakhstan and on the international market for the development and improvement of the Department of quality management of medical services of KSCD&ID; 2) Training of competent and competitive specialists for medical organizations and organizations of medical education in the specialty "Dermatovenerology, dermatocosmetology (adult, children's)".

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Out of 8 standards conform: fully - 7, partially – 1.

Standard 8: *completed*

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

- 1) Improve monitoring of the quality system and document the results of this process.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

Proof of compliance:

The KSCD&ID has a system of updating the organizational structure and administration in accordance with new regulations and the needs of practical Health care. KSCD&ID employees actively participate in the development of clinical protocols on current topics, develop methodological recommendations, publish articles, and conduct thematic analyses. A scientific and practical journal has been published continuously since 1999, and its status should be strengthened. KSCD&ID is the leading organization in this area and the practice base for all universities that train residents and practitioners in the specialty: "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)". In this regard, it is necessary to strengthen the status of KSCD&ID.

Taking into account that since 2018 the Republican AIDS Control Center of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan has become a part of the KSCD&ID and HIV research is being conducted, it is advisable to work on including the discipline on HIV infection in the educational programme, while maintaining the coordinating role and developing an action plan for interaction with educational organizations.

If possible, it is recommended to prepare a scientific and practical journal "Issues of Dermatology and Venereology" in the list of journals recommended by the Committee for Quality Control in the field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (9.3.).

In order to strengthen the status of KSCD&ID, it is necessary to consolidate the dermatological service of the Republic of Kazakhstan (9.1.). Given the relevance of studying and training on the topic of "HIV infections", it is advisable to work on including this topic in the educational programme of the residency. You should write to the Department of Science and Human Resources of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan about this.

Conclusions of the EEC by criteria. Out of 5 standards conform: fully – 5.

Recommendations for improvements identified during the external session:

- 1) For the purpose of continuous development of the scientific center, an existing scientific and practical journal is recommended: "Questions of dermatology and venereology" should be prepared for inclusion in the list recommended by the State Tax Service of the Republic of Kazakhstan (9.3.).
- 2) In order to strengthen the status of KSCD&ID, it is necessary to consolidate the service of the Republic of Kazakhstan (9.1.)

6. Recommendations for improving the institutional activities of the KSCD&ID:

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

- 3) In order to strengthen scientific activities in the strategic development plan of the KSCD&ID, add:
 - participation in competitions of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, young scientists, Zhas Galym, etc.;
 - planning of advanced training in teaching skills.
- 4) In order to further ensure the development of KSCD&ID and strengthen scientific potential, conduct training of employees through master's and doctoral studies in cooperation with universities in Kazakhstan (paragraph 1.1.3).

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

- 5) It is recommended to include a scientific component based on evidence-based medicine and up-to-date literature data in the educational programme of residency, additional and non-formal education programmes (paragraphs 2.2.1, 2.2.2).
- 6) Introduce the discipline "Management of scientific research" into the educational programme of the residency.

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT AND DOCUMENTATION

- 7) Improve methods for assessing the academic performance of residents, including computer-generated forms and verification of independent work performed by residents under the "Anti-plagiarism" system (item 3.2.1).

Standard 4: THE HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS

Develop an algorithm (methodological guide) on resident-patient interaction.

Standard 5: CPD PROVISION

1. Strengthen the mechanism for monitoring the introduction and implementation of components in the residency training programme and advanced training programmes formed after receiving feedback from representatives of practical Health care.
2. When training residents, involve practitioners from both their own clinical base and third-party medical organizations in mentoring and document this process accordingly (point 5.2.3).

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL AND CPD ACTIVITIES

- 8) Expand practical bases corresponding to the profile/subject of educational programmes of postgraduate and additional education (6.2.2);
- 9) Provide access to up-to-date resources 24/7 with a subscription to international databases (6.1.3.);

Standard 7: EVALUATION OF CPD ACTIVITIES

- 10) Conduct a systematic analysis of the results of training of residents and introduce anonymous surveys (questionnaires) of residents and employees to obtain objective data for the purpose of improvement (clause 7.1.1);
- 11) Provide advanced training programmes with topics on oncodermatology and venereal diseases in order to meet the needs of practical health care and in accordance with the requests of NPR students (paragraph 7.2.2).

Standard 8: ORGANISATION

- 12) Improve monitoring of the quality system and document the results of this process.

Standard 9: Continuous renewal

- 13) For the purpose of continuous development of the scientific center, an existing scientific and practical journal is recommended: "Questions of dermatology and venereology" should be prepared for inclusion in the list recommended by the State Tax Service of the Republic of Kazakhstan (9.3.).
- 14) In order to strengthen the status of KSCD&ID, it is necessary to consolidate the service of the Republic of Kazakhstan (9.1.)

7.Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC established compliance with the Standards for Institutional accreditation of Medical organizations of postgraduate and additional and non-formal education and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council accredit the RSE "Kazakh Scientific Center of Dermatology and Infectious Diseases" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan as an organization providing postgraduate and additional and non-formal education for a period of 5 years

EEC chairperson Balmukhanova Aygul

Foreign Expert Gulnara Ibadova

Academic Expert Imasheva Bagdat Sakenovna

Academic Expert Almira Akhmetova

Expert Employer Amanzholova Meruert Temirtasovna

Expert Student Elvira Sahabieva



The image shows six handwritten signatures in blue ink, each written on a horizontal line. The signatures are arranged vertically from top to bottom, corresponding to the names listed on the left. The first signature is a stylized 'B', the second is 'Gulnara', the third is 'Imasheva', the fourth is 'Almira', the fifth is 'Meruert', and the sixth is 'Elvira'.

Quality profile and criteria for external institutional assessment (summary) of organizations of postgraduate, additional and non-formal education (continuing professional development)

Standard	Assessment Criteria	Number of standards	Assessment		
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Non compliant
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	11	11	--	-
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	13	11	2-3	-
3.	ASSESSMENT AND DOCUMENTATION	11	10	1-4	-
4.	THE HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS	13	13	--	-
5.	CPD PROVISION	11	10	1-6	-
6.	EDUCATIONAL AND CPD ACTIVITIES	15	14	1-7	-
7.	EVALUATION OF CPD ACTIVITIES	10	9	1-8	-
8.	ORGANISATION	8	7	1-9	-
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	5	5	--	-
	Total:	97	90	7	
			97		

**List of documents studied by the EEC members in the framework of the
conducting institutional accreditation**

No	. Name of documents	Quantity	Date of approval
1.	Report on Institutional accreditation of KSCD&ID 2022	1	September 2022
2.	Report on specialized accreditation of KSCD&ID 2022	1	September 2022
3.	Licenses educational activity of kaz/rus with Attachment	5	23.07.2019
4.	Previous FA and CA certificates	1 archive	25.06.2018
5.	Certificate of scientific accreditation	1	05.08.2022
6.	Data on scientific activities of	KSCD&ID 1	17-19. 10. 2022
7.	Regulations on the clinical mentor	1	26.09.2021
8.	GCP	2 certificates	19.01.2021 01.10.2021
9.	Memorandum agreement with the Regional Infectious Diseases Hospital	1	25.03.2021
10	Certificates of advanced training teachers	3+1 archive	Indicated in accordance with obtaining certificates
11	Government Decree on reorganization	1	14.09.2018
12	Photos	1 Archive	17-19. 10. 2022
13	Memorandum agreement with the Medea multidisciplinary Center	1	
14	Memorandum agreement with the International Academy of Postgraduate Education LLP"	1	25.09.2019
15	Memorandum agreement with Vitiligo and Skin Health Center LLP	1	22.08.2022
16	Information on the residency EP	programme 1	17-19. 10. 2022
17	Information on the additional EP	programme 1	17-19. 10. 2022
18	EADV Membership certificate	1	01.01.2022- 01.01.2023
19	Certificate of attendance EADV	2	02.10.2021
20	Certificate of dermatoscopy resident	1	16.05.2022
21	Memorandum agreement with "YES" LLP	1	01.07.2021
22	Employment of graduates	1	18.10.2022
23	Strategic plan of KSCD&ID 2020-2024	1	13.07.2020